

Role of Emerging Pedagogical Approaches in Civic on Students' Learning at Grade X

Arshad Ali¹ and Jam Muhammad Zafar²

<https://doi.org/10.62345/jads.2025.14.3.144>

Abstract

The main objectives of the study were to investigate current pedagogical trends in secondary level, analyze how caregiver competence affects students, and identify factors that affect caregiver performance at the elementary level. This survey-based study used both quantitative and qualitative methods (QUAN-qual.), with a sample of 72 teachers and 360 elementary school children, for a total of 432 individuals. The researchers followed L.R.GAY's sampling chart when selecting participants. Research tools included questionnaires with three parts: part-1: demographic; part-2: closed-ended; and part-3: open-ended. The questionnaires were administered to sampled respondents. Additionally, an observation sheet was used to collect data specific to the elementary class children. To ensure validity & reliability, all research tools underwent pilot testing and were assessed for accuracy through expert opinion, and Cronbach's alpha was used to test questionnaire reliability. SPSS-24 statistical software was employed for the analysis, which included using relevant formulas such as frequency and percentage measures and the standard deviation.

Keywords: Pedagogy, Pedagogical Trends, Pedagogical Approaches, Grade X Students.

Introduction

The Civics classroom plays an important role in helping students become engaged and caring citizens, locally, nationally, and globally. It is expected that the Civics course will use some teaching methods and strategies of the teachers in the learning-teaching process so that the students can have certain qualifications within the defined goals and show the permanent behavioural changes (Yousaf et al., 2021; Anjum & Zafar, 2022; Ramzan et al., 2023; Hassan et al., 2024; Arshad et al., 2025; Bano & Zafar, 2025). The most appropriate strategies and methods should be determined, taking into consideration the purpose, subject, learning environment, and student characteristics

1. Critical thinking and problem-solving
2. Diligent citizenship and community engagement
3. Social liability and awareness
4. Intercultural comprehension and empathy
5. Democratic values and human rights

Emerging Pedagogies

1. *Inquiry-Based Learning:* Motivates students to examine civic issues, analyze data, and develop evidence-based arguments.

¹MPhil Scholar, Department of Education, National College of Business Administration and Economics (NCBAE) Sub-campus Rahim Yar Khan, Punjab Pakistan. Email: arshadmahar927@gmail.com

²Associate Professor, Department of Education, Khwaja Fareed University of Engineering and Information Technology (KFUEIT) Rahim Yar Khan, Punjab Pakistan. Email: dr.zafar@kfueit.edu.pk



2. *Project-Based Learning*: Involves students in real-world civic projects, encouraging collaboration, critical thinking, and problem-solving.
3. *Service-Learning*: constituent community service with academic learning, promoting civic engagement and social responsibility.
4. *Gamification*: Exploits game design elements to teach civic capabilities, improving engagement and motivation.
5. *Flipped Classroom*: Reverses traditional teaching, promotes student-centered discussion and debate on civic issues.

Benefits

- Enlarge civic knowledge and consciousness.
- Enhanced critical thinking and problem-solving skills
- Improved community engagement and social responsibility
- Advanced empathy and intercultural understanding
- Motivates active citizenship and democratic participation

Theoretical Framework

1. *Social Cognitive Theory*: Stresses observation, imitation, and reinforcement in civic learning.
2. *Critical Pedagogy*: Emphasizes power relations, social justice, and transformative learning.
3. *Civic Identity Theory*: Research how students progress civic identity and agency.

Effective Practices

- Constituent civic education into existing subjects (e.g., social studies, language arts).
- Ask out guest speakers from community organizations and the government.
- Conduct debates, discussions, and role-plays on civic issues.
- Motivate student-led civic projects and initiatives.
- Exploit technology (e.g., online platforms, simulations) to enhance civic learning.

Assessment Strategies

- Project-based evaluations
- Reflective portfolios and journals
- Class debates and discussions
- Civic engagement logs and self-assessments
- Standardized civic aptitude tests

By incorporating emerging pedagogies, educators can foster civic competence among matric-level students, preparing them for active participation in democratic societies.

Statement of the Problem

Secondary School Teacher pedagogical competence enhances the quality of teaching, especially at the secondary level, thereby improving the quality of learning in Civics. The secondary school teachers are therefore in a better position to contribute more effectively to their students and colleagues in Civic. The secondary school teachers 'emerging Pedagogical responsibilities, management, and academic advancement are the main goals of effective Pedagogical approaches of Civic grade 10. Providing secondary school teachers with an efficient pedagogical training process. The statement of the problem is "role of rising pedagogical come on in Civics on students' learning at Grade 10 in district Gotki."

Research Objectives

The objectives of the study will be;

- To analyze the role of occurring pedagogical approaches in Civics on students' learning in Grade 10
- To compare the role of emerging pedagogical approaches in Civic on boys' and girls' learning at Grade 10
- To compare the role of materializing pedagogical approaches in Civics on urban and rural students' learning at Grade 10.
- To compare the role of emerging pedagogical approaches in Civic on students' learning of public and private sectors at Grade 10.

Research Questions

The research questions of the study will be;

1. What is the role of emerging pedagogical meets in Civic on students' learning in Grade 10?
2. Are there characteristics in the role of emerging pedagogical approaches in Civic on boys and girls students' learning at Grade-10?
3. Is there a difference in the role of emerging pedagogical approaches in Civic on urban and rural students' learning at Grade-10?
4. Is there diversity in the role of emerging pedagogical approaches in Civic on students' learning of the public and private sectors at Grade 10

Literature Review

A literature review is a survey of scholarly sources (such as books, journal articles, and theses) related to a specific topic or research question. It is often written as part of a thesis, dissertation, or research paper, in order to situate your work in relation to existing knowledge (Ahmad et al., 2021; Rao et al., 2023; Ahmad & Zafar, 2025).

Civic education has traditionally relied on textbooks and teacher-led lectures focusing on government structures, rights, and responsibilities. However, evolving societal dynamics call for more engaging, critical, and experiential pedagogies. For Grade X students—typically 15–16 years old—these approaches can foster critical civic dispositions, identity, and actionable knowledge. Emerging methods such as public sphere pedagogy, project-based learning, emancipatory pedagogy, participatory action research, and action teaching are increasingly relevant for nurturing informed, active citizens.

Public Sphere Pedagogy

Public sphere pedagogy (PSP) prepares students to engage in democratic discourse beyond the classroom by integrating assignments and reflections into real-life civic forums (Abbas & Zafar, 2025). In PSP models like "Town Hall Meetings" and public debates, Grade X learners research issues, share perspectives, and practice civil discourse in authentic contexts alongside civic participants, including local officials, media, and peers. This experiential model equips students with dialogue, argumentation, and deliberative skills essential for democratic life (Zafar et al., 2023; Mumtaz et al., 2024).

Project-Based Learning (PBL)

Pupils are involved in actual studies over long periods through project-based learning. According to Dar Yasseri et al. (2018), Basheer and Zafar (2025) and Riaz et al. (2025), it moves away from memorizing facts toward inquiry, problem-solving, and teamwork. During a PBL activity, learners in School X's civics programs are often asked to choose a community problem (such as local governance, environmental issues, or urban development), conduct

research on it, develop workable solutions, and report their findings to peers. Students get a sense of individuality, civic capabilities, and capacity for talent thinking as a result (Shakir et al., 2012; Naz & Zafar, 2023; Mughal et al., 2024; Rasheed et al., 2024; Shaheen et al., 2025).

Emancipator Pedagogy

Emancipated methodology, which is based on Freire's theories of a critical approach to learning, empowers children by encouraging them to analyse their ideas, social norms, and power dynamics (Giroux, 2001; Nouri & Sajjadi, 2014; Bibi et al., 2025). For Elementary X students, this means applying structures such as the Five "E"s (Engage, Explore, Explain, Elaborate, Evaluate) to confront disparities and imagine solutions through discussion, introspection, and cooperative study. With this method, civics class is transformed from a sedentary means of acquiring content into an actively creative practice that addresses interpersonal and individual shifts (Giroux, 2001; Munawar et al., 2014; Ahmad & Zafar, 2025).

Participatory Action Research (PAR)

As fellow investigators, youngsters analyse neighbourhoods and suggest adjustments as part of PAR in education for young people (Mahar & Zafar, 2025). Youth PAR (Youth PAR) for Grades X students may entail analysing school-based concerns (such as inclusiveness or depression), collecting information through questionnaires or conversations, evaluating the results, and creating socially beneficial projects. Adolescents' enhanced optimism and civic proclivities result from their encounter with genuine civic concerns, which foster civic identity formation.

Action Teaching

Engaged schooling combines education with real-world public effect. It uses social-activity initiatives to enhance curricular material and adheres to Kurt Lewin's empirical approach (Khursheed & Zafar, 2025). Teachers may incorporate initiatives such as voter registration drives, awareness campaigns, or sustainability projects into their Grade 10 civic education courses, allowing pupils to learn while contributing to society. In contrast to conventional lecture-style learning, research shows that active training improves civic mindsets, connection with others, and involvement (Rasheed et al., 2025; Arshad et al., 2025; Shafique & Zafar, 2025).

Critical Civic Engagement (CCE)

According to Schmidt (2021), community engagement is an organizing principle that links learners' lives to civic identity, particularly across diverse towns and cities. It has already been demonstrated that CCE contributes more effectively to civic identity than cognitive knowledge alone. For the sake of aged X pupils, this means cultivating civic perspectives, contributing to efforts, and becoming acquainted with topics related to their locales.

Research Methodology

The systematic, strategic approach to conducting research, including the design, methods, and analysis used to answer a research question, is called research methodology (Sadaf et al., 2024; Ahmad et al., 2025; Soomro et al., 2025; Yousaf et al., 2025). The research methodology will consist of the following steps:

Research Design

“Design of the research comprises the whole procedure that is conducted in the research” (Ahmad et al., 2022). The research utilized surveys as its methodology, with a focus on

description. Both quantitative and qualitative (QUAN-qual.) approaches were employed, in conjunction with the explanatory sequential technique.

Population

The population is defined as a set of individuals, data, or items from which a statistical sample is taken (Younas et al., 2023). The population of the study was:

- All Secondary school teachers of District Ghotki.
- All Grade 10 students in District Ghotki.

Sampling / Sample / Sample Size

The recommended study will employ cluster sampling. This research will be conducted in the District. Ghotki. The statistical matrix provided by L.R. Gay in his book Educational Research will be used by the analyst.

The sample of the study will consist of;

- Seventy-two (72) secondary school teachers of district Ghotki
- There are 360 high school pupils in the Ghotki area.

A total of 432 people will be included in the research sample.

Research Tools

The Questionnaire will be acquired for data collection from head teachers and Secondary school teachers. The observance sheet will be designed for data collection from students of Secondary classes in District Ghotki.

Pilot Study

To ensure the questionnaire's validity, expert opinion will be used, and its reliability will be computed using the Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS-24) with Cronbach's Alpha.

Data Collection

The Questionnaire will be acquired for data collection from Secondary school teachers. The observance sheet will be designed for data collection from students of Secondary classes in District Ghotki.

Data Analysis

The researcher will properly analyse the collected data. The researcher will create a data sheet in SPSS and enter the data. The researcher will apply specific statistical tests and formulas to analyse the data, including frequency distributions, mean scores, percentages, and standard deviations.

Data Analysis

Part-I: Qualitative Data Analysis

Table 1: Factor-1: Introduction of Civic

RPS	Argument	Thoughts						SD	Mean
		1	2	3	4	5	Sum		
Item.1	F	2	24	12	22	12	72	1.18	3.276
	%	2.5	33	17.5	30.0	17.5	100		
Item.2	F	1	4	27	20	20	72	1.012	3.73
	%	2.5	5.0	37.5	27.5	27.5	100		
Item.3	F	3	10	13	24	22	72	1.2075	3.68
	%	5.0	15.0	17.5	32.5	30.0	100		
Total	F	2	5.3	8.1	12.5	11.9	72	1.1265	3.7047
	%	3.8	13.4	21.4	31.4	29.9	100		

Table 1 factor-1, introduction of Civic data analysis represents that 31.4% of Jests teacher are mostly, 29.9% of HSTs teacher are always, 21.4% of HSTs teacher are sometimes, 13.4% of HSTs teacher are rarely and 3.8% of HSTs teacher are never agreed with the given statements. As a whole majority HSTs A majority of educators concur with the assertions made. The propositions were backed by the mean score of 3.7047 and the standard deviation of 1.126.

Table 2: Factor-2: Individual and society

RPS	Argument	Thoughts						SD	Mean
		1	2	3	4	5	Sum		
Item.4	F	0	7	10	38	17	72	.8826	3.88
	%	0	10.0	15.0	52.5	22.5	100		
Item.5	F	2	12	18	25	15	72	1.086	3.53
	%	2.5	18	25.0	35.0	20.0	100		
Item.6	F	2	13	9	37	11	72	1.033	3.6001
	%	2.5	18	12.5	50.5	12.0	100		
Item.7	F	3	15	16	18	20	72	1.241	3.501
	%	5.0	20.0	22.5	25.0	26	100		
Item.8	F	3	12	11	11	35	72	1.3376	3.824
	%	5.0	18	15.0	15.0	48	100		
Total	F	1.37	6	7.25	14.3	11.2	72	1.1200	3.7092
	%	4	15	19	35	27	100		

Table 2 individual and society data analysis represents that 31.4% of HSTs teacher are mostly, 29.9% of HSTs teacher are always, 21.4% of HSTs teacher are sometimes, 13.4% of HSTs teacher are rarely and 3.8% of HSTs Teacher are never agreed with the given statements. A majority of educators concur with the assertions made. The propositions were backed by the mean score of 3.7092 and the standard deviation of 1.1200.

Table 3: Factor-3: State

RPS	Argument	Thoughts						SD	Mean
		1	2	3	4	5	Sum		
Item.9	F	0	13	11	28	20	72	1.0496	3.774
	%	0	17.5	15.0	40.0	27.5	100		
Item.10	F	0	5	18	18	31	72	.9998	4.024
	%	0	7.5	25.0	25.0	42.5	100		
Item.11	F	0	11	12	31	18	72	.99967	3.776
	%	0	15.0	17.5	42.5	25.0	100		
Item.12	F	3	19	6	22	22	72	1.32020	3.53
	%	5.0	27.5	7.5	30.0	30.0	100		
Item.13	F	2	7	10	24	29	72	1.0975	3.9850
	%	2.5	10.0	15.0	32.5	40.0	100		
Total	F	1.12	5.75	7.62	13	13	72	1.118	3.74
	%	2.8	14.3	19.0	33	31.2	100		

Table 3 presents factor-3, state. Data analysis represents that 33% HSTs teachers and caregivers are mostly, 31.2% of HSTs teacher are always, 19% of HSTs teacher are sometimes, 14.3% of HSTs teacher are rarely and 2.8% HSTs teacher are never agreed with the given statements. A

majority of educators concur with the assertions made. The propositions were backed by the mean score of 3.74 and the standard deviation of 1.118.

Table 4: Factor-4: Government

RPS	Argument	Thoughts						SD	Mean
		1	2	3	4	5	Sum		
Item.14	F	2	13	18	18	21	72	1.1698	3.650
	%	2.5	17.5	25.0	25.0	30.0	100		
Item.15	F	3	17	17	25	10	72	1.14101	3.33
	%	5.0	22.5	22.5	35.0	15.0	100		
Item.16	F	3	8	12	11	38	72	1.261	4.001
	%	5.0	10.0	17.5	15.0	52.5	100		
	%	20.0	10.0	27.5	40.0	2.5	100		
Item.17	F	0	9	11	30	22	72	.98188	3.901
	%	0	12.5	15.0	42.5	30.0	100		
Item.18	F	2	9	20	18	23	72	1.13189	3.73
	%	2.5	12.5	27.5	25.0	32.5	100		
Total	F	2.8	5.6	8.6	11.8	11.2	72	1.1669	3.763
	%	7	13	22	30	28	100		

Table 4 presents factor-4, government. Data analysis represents that 33% HSTs teachers and caregivers are mostly, 31.2% of HSTs teacher are always, 19% of HSTs teacher are sometimes, 14.3% of HSTs teacher are rarely and 2.8% HSTs teacher are never agreed with the given statements. A majority of educators concur with the assertions made. The propositions were backed by the mean score of 3.763 and the standard deviation of 1.1669

Table 5: Factor-5: Citizen and Citizenship

RPS	Argument	Thoughts						SD	Mean
		1	2	3	4	5	Sum		
Item.19	F	0	3	20	20	29	72	.94689	4.020
	%	0	5.0	27.5	27.5	40.0	100		
Item.20	F	2	12	18	25	15	72	1.09	3.531
	%	1	19	24	36.0	20.0	100		
Item.21	F	2	13	9	37	11	72	1.034	3.601
	%	3	17	12.5	50.5	12.0	100		
Item.22	F	3	15	16	18	20	72	1.243	3.510
	%	5.0	20.0	23	25.0	26	100		
Item.23	F	3	12	11	11	35	72	1.3375	3.825
	%	6	17	15.0	15.0	48	100		
Total	F	0.33	4	9	12.6	13.6	72	1.021	3.881
	%	1.16	10	23.3	31.6	34.1	100		

Table 5 presents factor 5 citizen and citizenship. Data analysis shows that 34.1% of HST teachers and caregivers are mostly in agreement, 31.6% are always in agreement, 23.3% are sometimes in agreement, 10% are rarely in agreement, and 1.16% are never in agreement with the given statements. A majority of educators concur with the assertions made. The propositions were backed by the mean score of 3.881 and the standard deviation of 1.021

Discussion

Table 1 factor-1 introduction of Civic data analysis represents that 31.4% of Jests teacher are mostly, 29.9% of Jests teacher are always, 21.4% of Jests teacher are sometimes, 13.4% of Jests teacher are rarely and 3.8% of Jests teachers are never in agreement with the given statements. As a whole, Jests teacher are mostly in agreement with the given statements. The mean score 3.7047 and standard deviation of 1.126 supported the statements.

Table 2 individual and society data analysis represents that 31.4% of Jests teacher are mostly, 29.9% of Jests teacher are always, 21.4% of Jests teacher are sometimes, 13.4% of Jests teacher are rarely and 3.8% of Jests teacher are never in agreement with the given statements. As a whole, Jests teacher are mostly in agreement with the given statements. The mean score of 3.7047 and standard deviation of 1.126 supported the statements

Table 3 presents factor-3, state: Data analysis shows that 33% of Jests teachers and caregivers are mostly in agreement, 31.2% are always in agreement, 19% are sometimes in agreement, 14.3% are rarely in agreement, and 2.8% are never in agreement with the given statements. As a whole, the majority of Jests teachers agree with the given statements. The mean score 3.74 and standard deviation of 1.118 supported the statements.

Table 4 presents factor-4, government: Data analysis shows that 33% of Jests teachers and caregivers are mostly, 31.2% of Jests teachers are always, 19% of Jests teachers are sometimes, 14.3% of Jests teachers are rarely, and 2.8% of Jests teachers are never in agreement with the given statements. As a whole, the majority of Jests teachers agree with the given statements. The mean score 3.74 and standard deviation of 1.118 supported the statements.

Table 5: Presents Factor 5: Citizen and Citizenship: Data analysis shows that 34.1% of Jests teachers and caregivers are mostly in agreement, 31.6% are always in agreement, 23.3% are sometimes in agreement, 10% are rarely in agreement, and 1.16% are never in agreement with the given statements. As a whole, the majority of Jests teachers agree with the given statements. The mean score 3.74 and standard deviation of 1.118 supported the statements.

Conclusion

First indicator of the study was Introduction of civic, the study concluded that majority of the overall JESTs and students were agreed with the statement that they teach theme of civic in Civic class 10 through the lecture method, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach basic need of human in science class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach number of the member countries of united states activities in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, Second indicator of the study was Individual and society, the study concluded that majority of the overall JESTs and students were agreed with the statement that they teach significance of a family in social life in civic class 10 through the reading , teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach society and express the relationship between the individual and society in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach basic difference between nation and nationality in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach community and its various type in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they difference between western and Islamic concept of nationhood in civic class 10 through the

reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided.

Second indicator of the study was Individual and society, the study concluded that majority of the overall JESTs and students were agreed with the statement that they teach significance of a family in social life in civic class 10 through the reading , teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach society and express the relationship between the individual and society in civic class 10 through the reading , teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach basic difference between nation and nationality in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach community and its various type in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they difference between western and Islamic concept of nationhood in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided.

Third indicator of the study was state, the study concluded that majority of the overall JESTs and students were agreed with the statement that they teach state and its components in civic class 10 through the reading , teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach State and government in civic class 10 through the reading , teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach state and society in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach function of the state in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, , they teach Islamic state the sovereignty rest in Allah in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided.

Four indicator of the study was government , the study concluded that majority of the overall JESTs and students were agreed with the statement that they teach government and explain the function of an executive in civic class 10 through the reading , teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach Responsibilities of the legislative in a democratic form of government in civic class 10 through the reading , teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach significance and duties of Judiciary in a democratic from the government in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach democracy and its merits and demerit in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, , they teach difference between parliamentary and presidential forms of government in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided.

Fifth indicator of the study was citizen and citizenship, the study concluded that majority of the overall JESTs and students were agreed with the statement that they teach citizenship in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach characteristic of a good citizenship in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach hurdles in the way of good citizenship in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject

matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach differentiate among citizen, national in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided, they teach individual loose his citizenship in civic class 10 through the reading, teachers expertise in the subject matter they instruct while some of were not agreed whereas few were undecided.

Recommendations

- Emerging pedagogical approaches are necessary for students' learning during unit 1: introduction to Civic education at grade 10. The modern pedagogical approaches may be adopted and preferred in the teaching of civic education at the secondary level.
- The emerging pedagogical approaches are necessary for students' learning during unit 2, individual and society in Civic at grade 10. The modern pedagogical approaches may be adopted and preferred in the teaching of civic education at the secondary level.
- The emerging pedagogical approaches are necessary for students' learning during unit 3, state in Civic at grade 10. The modern pedagogical approaches may be adopted and preferred in the teaching of civic education at the secondary level.

References

- Abbas, S., & Zafar, J. M. (2025). Role of Educational Technologies in Students' Affective Learning at Secondary School Level. *Journal of Asian Development Studies*, 14(2), 1257-1264.
- Ahmad, A., & Maitlo, S. K. Rasheed & Soomro, AR, Ahmed, A. (2021). Impact of Phonological Instructions in the Enhancement of ESL Learners' Pronunciation. *Remittances Review*, 6(1), 94-109.
- Ahmad, A., Farhat, P. A., & Choudhary, S. M. (2022). Students' Insights about the Influence of Text Messaging on Academic Writing Skills. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 3(4), 522-533.
- Ahmad, A., Maitlo, S. K., Khokhar, M. I., & Yousaf, I. (2025). Critical Discourse Analysis of the Figurative Language in the Shakespearean Dark Lady Sonnets. *Journal of Arts and Linguistics Studies*, 3(3), 3795-3844.
- Ahmad, I., & Zafar, J. M. (2025). Impact of Instructor's Behavior on Learner's Motivation at Elementary School Level. *The Critical Review of Social Sciences Studies*, 3(4), 1685-1700.
- Ahmed, I., & Zafar, J. M. (2025). Analyzing the Effect of Emerging Pedagogies on Students' Problem-Solving Ability in Mathematics at Secondary Level. *Journal of Asian Development Studies*, 14(3), 1615-1630.
- Anjum, Z. I., & Zafar, J. M. (2022). A study on decision making of head teachers at school level. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 3(3), 821-832.
- Arshad, Z., Ahmad, A., & Zafar, J. M. (2025). Role of Head Teachers in Instructional Supervision of Secondary School Teachers in Rahim Yar Khan. *The Critical Review of Social Sciences Studies*, 3(3), 442-453.
- Arshad, Z., Mehmood, M. S., & Ahmad, A. (2025). Exploring the Educational Memes in Recent Indo-Pak War. *Dialogue Social Science Review (DSSR)*, 3(8), 87-102.
- Bano, S., & Zafar, J. M. (2025). Effect of Game-Based Instructions on Learners' Academic Performance at the Primary Level. *Social Science Review Archives*, 3(4), 2062-2071.

- Bashir, N., & Zafar, J. M. (2025). Effect of Teachers' Communication Style on Students' Learning at Elementary Level: An analysis. *The Critical Review of Social Sciences Studies*, 3(3), 2886-2895.
- Bibi, S., Shahzad, A., Kubra, K. T., & Riaz, M. (2025). The Impact of Hybrid Learning and Intrinsic Motivation on Students' Academic Learning Achievements at University Level in Educational Settings in Pakistan. *The Critical Review of Social Sciences Studies*, 3(4), 01-10.
- Dar Yasser, P. M. Finley, B. E., Mayfield, D. W., & Davis, P. (2018). The hard work of soft skills: augmenting the project-based learning experience with interdisciplinary teamwork. *Instructional Science*.
- Gay, L. R., Mills, G. E., & Airasian, P. (2012). *Educational research: Competencies for analysis and applications* (10th ed.). Pearson Education.
- Giroux, H. A. (2001). Theory and resistance in education: Towards a pedagogy for the opposition. Bergin & Garvey.
- Hassan, S., Zafar, J. M., & Ullah, N. (2024). Effect of Using Problem Solving Technique of 5Es Instructional Model on Student' Learning at Secondary Level: An Analysis. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 12(2), 2279-2289.
- Khursheed, A., & Zafar, J. M. (2025). Impact of Parental Immersion on Their Children's Instruction at Primary Level Education. *The Critical Review of Social Sciences Studies*, 3(4), 1194-1205.
- Mahar, G. M., & Zafar, J. M. (2025). Role of Emerging Pedagogical Approaches to Help Students' Learning in English at Grade-V: An Analysis. *The Critical Review of Social Sciences Studies*, 3(3), 323-331.
- Mughal, Z., Zafar, J. M., & Ullah, N. (2023). The Role of Principal as Instructional Leader: Effects on Teaching and Learning Practices and Activities on Students' Achievement at Institutes of Sukkur IBA University. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 7(3), 399-413.
- Mumtaz, A., Zafar, J. M., & Andleeb, S. (2024). Identifying the teachers professional challenges about utilizing technology, conferences, seminars and workshops at secondary level. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 5(1), 115-126.
- Munawar, N., Zafar, J. M., Rasheed, H. R., & Munawar, A. (2024). Effect Of Feedback On Students' Learning At Primary Level: An Analysis. *Educational Administration: Theory and Practice*, 30(8), 480-485.
- Naz, L. H., & Zafar, J. M. (2023). The Role of External Monitoring in Enhancing the Academic Quality in Secondary Schools. *Al-Qanṭara*, 9(3), 685-706.
- Ramzan, M., Zafar, J. M., & Hussain, M. (2023). Effect of blended learning strategies on university students' skill development. *Pakistan Journal of Educational Research*, 6(2), 263-278.
- Rao, I. S., Jeevan, S., & Ahmad, A. (2023). Impact of Metacognitive Strategies on Creative Writing of ESL Students at College Level in District Lahore. *Global Language Review*, 8(1), 315-324.
- Rasheed, B., Zafar, J. M., & Shaheen, R. (2024). Measuring the Cognitive Learning of Graduate Students about Zero Conditional Sentences in English at KFUEIT: The Descriptive and Explanatory Analysis. *Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review*, 8(2), 52-65.
- Rasheed, H. R., Zafar, J. M., & Munawar, N. (2024). Emerging trends of assessment and evaluation toward students' learning in early childhood education: An analysis. *Remittances Review*, 9(3), 442-456.

- Riaz, M., Yousaf, I., & Yousaf, S. (2025). An Analysis of Healthcare Leaders' Experience as They Endeavor to Nurture a Climate of Psychological Safety. *The Critical Review of Social Sciences Studies*, 3(3), 720-731.
- Sadaf, H., Rasheed, B., & Ahmad, A. (2024). Exploring the role of YouTube lectures, vlogs, and videos in enhancing ESL learning. *Journal of Asian Development Studies*, 13(2), 657-670.
- Shafique, S., & Zafar, J. M. (2025). Role of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) in Students' Psychomotor Learning at Elementary Level. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 6(3), 234-247.
- Shaheen, R., Soomro, A. R., Maitlo, S. K., & Ahmad, A. (2025). Role of Curriculum and Instructive Resources in Reinforcement: A Critical Discourse Analysis of Textbooks. *Journal of Asian Development Studies*, 14(2), 1015-1022.
- Shakir, M., Lone, A. H., & Zafar, J. M. (2012). Measuring literacy mechanism and assessment of literacy levels in Pakistan. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 47, 391-395.
- Soomro, H. A., Khokhar, M. I., Ahmed, R., & Ahmad, A. (2025). Exploring Mortality, Memory and Cultural Identity: Thematic Analysis of Daud Kamal's Selected Poems. *The Critical Review of Social Sciences Studies*, 3(3), 17-33.
- Younus, J., Farhat, P. A., & Ahmad, A. (2023). Analyzing the factors involvement in declining Kalasha Language. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 11(3), 3520-3529.
- Yousaf, I., Abro, B. A., & Ahmad, A. (2025). Critical Discourse Analysis of the Symbolic Language in Shakespeare's Selected Dark Lady Sonnets. *Indus Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(3), 2019-230.
- Yousaf, S., Shahid, N. A., Zafar, J. M., & Ullah, N. (2021). Severity of Stress; Moderate Association between Empathy, and Psychological Distress among Teachers. *Linguistica Antverpiensia*, 10(1), 7728-7737.
- Zafar, J. M., Zahid, K., & Zahid, F. (2023). Impact of Teaching Methods on Student's learning in General Science in Secondary Schools. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 4(3), 425-435.