

# A Comparative Effectiveness of Training of Teachers Performance Conducted Under JICA, GTZ and PITE: A Case Study of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (Pakistan)

Manzoor Ilahi<sup>1</sup>, Umar Ali Khan<sup>2</sup>, Tabassum Naz<sup>3</sup> and Muhammad Ayaz<sup>4</sup>

<https://doi.org/10.62345/jads.2023.12.4.86>

## Abstract

The current research paper aimed to investigate the effectiveness of training of teachers' performance conducted under JICA, GTZ, and PITE, A case study of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The survey research design was applied as per the nature of the study. A sample of 114 JICA-trained teachers, 379 GTZ-trained teachers, and 760 PITE-trained teachers was chosen. The size was determined using Krejcie and Morgan's (1970) sample table. The researcher used the stratified sampling method. A questionnaire was developed on a five-point Likert scale including five dimensions of training, i.e., objectives, organization and easiness of training content, expertise of trainer, participation level of trainees, and facilities provided by three organizations. Content validation was completed through experts' judgment, whereas the reliability of research too was measured through Cronbach's Alpha, which was estimated at 0.793. The researcher personally administered the questionnaire to the respondents and considered the researcher while gathering data from the teachers. Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) was used. The key findings of the study reveal that teachers who received training are satisfied with the accompaniment of objectives, organization, and easiness of training content, the expertise of trainers, the participation level of trainees, and facilities provided by three organizations. The study recommended that the Government of KP developed a flow-up mechanism for such teachers to improve the professional skills of the teachers.

**Keywords:** JICA, GTZ, PITE, Teachers Training.

## Introduction

Every Pakistani national educational policy includes teacher education as a fundamental component. It was emphasized both in text and spirit. Pre-service and in-service training can improve the performance of teachers. Organizations at the national and international levels work hard to maintain and improve the performance of teachers. In this regard, the circumstances could be more encouraging in the provinces. To enhance the state of teacher education, JICA, GTZ,

---

<sup>1</sup>PhD Scholar, Department of Teacher Education, Qurtuba University of Science and Information Technology, Peshawar.

<sup>2</sup>Chairman, Department of Teacher Education, Qurtuba University of Science and Information Technology, Dera Ismail Khan.

<sup>3</sup>PhD Scholar, Department of Teacher Education, Qurtuba University of Science and Information Technology, Peshawar.

<sup>4</sup>Assistant Professor, Department of Education, University of Loralai, Baluchistan.



PITE, and other organizations trained the teachers by conducting workshops and refresher courses with the collaboration of the Provincial Institute of Teacher Education (PITE) (Tahira et al., 2020). In 2004, the Directorate of Staff Development (DSD) was established in the Punjab. For teachers, head teachers, teacher educators, and other relevant staff, it oversaw pre-service and ongoing professional development programs. Their job impacts the performance of education in schools. DSD's primary responsibilities include providing in-service training for public school teachers and associated personnel, pointing out and recommending policies and practices that facilitate high-quality education, and coordinating with other public organizations that offer pre-service training to teachers (Javed et al., 2012). In 2006, DSD assumed administrative responsibility over the Government College of Elementary Teachers (GCETs), and in 2009, the Punjab Institute of Teacher Education (PITE) amalgamated with DSD. DSD maintains a comprehensive network of cluster training and support centers at the district level to assist with teacher in-service training. Groups of schools come together through clustering. For primary school teachers, the centrally placed school will serve as both a support center and a cluster. 2011 saw the establishment of District Training and Support Centers (DTSCs), which allowed all districts in the province to participate in the Continuous Professional Development (CPD) program (Khalil et al., 2015). Planning, facilitating, coordinating, and carrying out in-service training and professional development activities for primary, elementary, secondary, and higher secondary school teachers at the district level was its duty (Kulshrestha & Pandey, 2013).

The goal of in-service teacher training is typical to keep teachers' professional knowledge and abilities up to date. The majority of experts think that Pakistan's current in-service teacher training system is more supply-driven than demand-driven. There needs to be discernible development in the in-service teacher program in terms of the teacher's knowledge and skills. It barely affects the academic performance of the students. Teachers are receiving in-service training from the provinces, but due to funding constraints, these programs are only sometimes offered. Thus, donor agencies fund the programs most of the time. The provinces' inadequate maintenance of their trained teacher database leads to several pieces of training for the same teachers (Kulshrestha & Pandey, 2013).

Training is described as a program that uses a variety of strategies to modify behaviors, attitudes, and abilities in order to produce results that are effective for a certain task or set of related tasks. Training is the methodical acquisition of knowledge, attitudes, and abilities necessary for an individual to function well in a position or task whose requirements can be reasonably well-defined in advance and which requires a pretty uniform output from anyone attempting it (Harris & Sass, 2011).

Additionally, a number of donor organizations, including UNICEF, UNESCO, the European Commission (EC), the World Bank (WB), Asian Development Bank (ADB), Department for International Development (DFID), Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), USAID, and UNESCO, support teacher education in Pakistan (Azam et al., 2014). The majority of programs supported by donors have prioritized the professional development of in-service teachers as a means of enhancing institutional capacity. This has greatly aided Pakistan's teacher education system. The majority of donor-funded projects have placed more emphasis on meeting quantitative goals than on qualitative changes in teacher education services (Ali, 2011). The role of JICA, GTZ, and PITE play a significant role in teachers' capacity building in different areas like assessment strategies, communication skills, subject matter knowledge, and, more precisely, pedagogical skills. This study has a great contribution to the overall role of such organizations in the teachers' capacity building in different areas. Almost 142285 teachers (104167 male and 38118

female) received training from those organizations in different professional areas of teaching. Therefore, this study has a great significant contribution to policymakers, teachers, and district education officers regarding the teacher's training and its impact on their performance. Therefore, the key focus of the study was to examine the effectiveness of training on teachers' performance conducted under JICA, GTZ, and PITE. A case study of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The following were the objectives of the study.

1. To compare the effectiveness of training of teacher's performance conducted under JICA, GTZ and PITE.
2. To compares the effectiveness of training of teachers' performance conducted under JICA, GTZ, and PITE in perspective of training objectives, organization and easiness of training content, the expertise of the trainer, the participation level of trainees, and facilities provided by the three organizations.

## Literature Review

### Role of JICA in Teachers' Training in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

An agency of the Japanese government, the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) collaborates in a number of areas, including infrastructure, health, and education, and offers development aid. From the 1950s, when it began operations in Pakistan, JICA has carried out numerous projects in diverse fields to aid in the nation's growth. From 2000 until the present, JICA's educational initiatives in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) are the subject of this review of the literature (Hussain et al., 2017). JICA's provincial educational initiatives in KP have greatly impacted its education system. The program has contributed to raising educational standards, expanding educational opportunities for everybody, and strengthening the ability of local communities and public servants. For instance, in rural KP, the "Support for Improvement of Primary Education in Rural Areas of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa" initiative contributed to lower dropout rates overall and among girls in particular, as well as higher enrollment rates (Abdullah & Akhtar, 2019).

JICA's visional initiatives in KP have been instrumental in raising educational standards, expanding educational opportunities, and strengthening the ability of local authorities and communities. Some of the major issues that KP's educational system is dealing with are low enrolment rates and poor facilities have been addressed in part by JICA's programs. To improve education in KP, however, there is still more work to be done, especially in sectors like secondary and higher education. To overcome these obstacles and achieve sustainable development in the province, JICA's ongoing assistance and cooperation with the KP government would be crucial. The "Strengthening of Primary Education in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa" project is one of JICA's primary education initiatives in the region. Through curriculum creation, teacher training programs, and the supply of learning materials, this initiative seeks to raise the standard of elementary education in the area (Hussain et al., 2017).

### Role of GTZ in Teachers Training in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Since 1961, Germany and Pakistan have collaborated on development projects together. Since 1990, the German organization named Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH has been conducting business in Pakistan. Its country headquarters is located in Islamabad, the nation's capital. To help them fulfill the needs of the job market, GIZ supports thousands of apprentices and vocational education programs. It helps the organizations in charge of the social security and health insurance programs to offer social protection to a sizable population. GIZ is

assisting the Pakistani government in ensuring that labor and environmental standards are maintained in the textile industry, which provides jobs for a large number of people (Mustafa, 2012).

The initiatives in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa carried out by GTZ/GIZ have been studied by a number of researchers. Shah and Khan's (2014) study evaluated the effect of GTZ/GIZ's "Education for All" programs on the region's primary education system. The project was determined to have a favorable effect on teacher performance, enrollment rates, and the quality of education.

Adams (2015) reported that the initiative raised community participation in educational planning and administration, which enhanced school facilities and raised enrolment rates.

### **Role of PITE in Teacher Training in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa**

The government of Pakistan introduced the idea of PITE (Provincial Institute for Teachers Education) in 1993 with the goal of institutionalizing regular trainer training. To address this issue, the nation developed Provincial Institutes for Teacher Education (PITEs). Establishing provincial teacher training institutions was the idea behind the PITE concept, which aimed to support Provincial Education Departments (PEDs) in creating efficient provincial strategies for putting teacher training policies and programs into action. These initiatives also included curriculum development, training methods, material development, and training administrators and trainers in teacher training institutions (Ahmad & Khan, 2020).

PITE's primary objective, according to Aziz and Butt (2022) was teacher training. The main takeaway from the TTP phase was that teacher preparation programs by themselves will not produce the necessary outcomes. To enforce the quality of education, it is necessary to improve the professional ability of a variety of target groups, such as district-level managers, administrative/ministerial personnel, principals, teachers, etc., the light of the knowledge gained throughout the TTP phase. PITE expanded its scope, carefully examined previous approaches, evaluated present capabilities, and pinpointed areas in teacher preparation that required development. Redeveloped and implemented a thorough training strategy based on the lessons learned.

### **Research Methodology**

The researcher applied a survey research design as per the nature of the study. Of these, 96,725 were trained which JICA trained 134 PSTs, GTZ trained 26000, and 70591 PSTs were trained by PITE during 2000-2010 (Ali et al., 2019). A sample of 114 JICA teachers, 379 GTZ teachers, and 760 PITE-certified teachers was chosen by using the Stratified sampling method, and stratification is based on organizations. According to Sekaran and Bougie (2016) disproportionate stratified sampling is adequate if there is variation in the stratum. The size was determined using a table of Krejcie and Morgan (1970). The sampling unit is chosen using this probability sampling strategy. Additionally, a stratified sampling method was used, and for this purpose disproportionate sampling method was applied. The researcher developed a questionnaire. Content validation was completed through experts' judgment, whereas the reliability of research too was measured through Cronbach Alpha which was estimated at 0.793. The researcher personally administered the questionnaire to the respondents and considered the researcher while gathering data from the teachers. Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) was used to test the statistical hypotheses.

## Results and Discussion

**Table 1: Mean difference in achievement of training objectives**

Scale	JICA		GTZ		PITE	
<b>SD</b>	10	9	33	9	56	7
<b>D</b>	9	8	23	6	44	6
<b>N</b>	13	11	34	9	41	5
<b>A</b>	65	57	235	62	569	75
<b>SA</b>	17	15	54	14	50	7
<b>Total</b>	<b>114</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>379</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>760</b>	<b>100</b>
<b>ANOVA</b>	<b>F-value: 15.761</b>			<b>P-value: 0.000</b>		

Table 1 shows the mean difference regarding the achievement of training objectives conducted by JICA, GTZ and PITE. The result shows that there is no significant difference in the achievement of training adjectives for primary school teachers performance of three organization ( $F=15.761$ ,  $p=0.000<.05$ ). In other words, all three organizations successfully achieved the training objectives.

**Table 2: Mean difference in appreciation for participation and interaction**

Scale	JICA		GTZ		PITE	
<b>SD</b>	13	11	29	8	29	4
<b>D</b>	8	7	31	8	30	4
<b>N</b>	7	6	32	8	22	3
<b>A</b>	77	68	241	64	621	82
<b>SA</b>	9	8	46	12	58	8
<b>Total</b>	<b>114</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>379</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>760</b>	<b>100</b>
<b>ANOVA</b>	<b>F-value: 24.178</b>			<b>P-value: 0.000</b>		

Table 2 shows the mean difference regarding the appreciation for participation and interaction conducted by JICA, GTZ and PITE. The result shows that there is no significant difference in the appreciation for participation and interaction of primary school teachers performance of three organization ( $F=25.178$ ,  $p=0.000<.05$ ). In other words, all three organizations successfully appreciated for participation and interaction.

**Table 3: Showing mean difference in content organization and easiness**

Scale	JICA		GTZ		PITE	
<b>SD</b>	18	16	24	6	41	5
<b>D</b>	7	6	39	10	15	2
<b>N</b>	6	5	19	5	38	5
<b>A</b>	81	71	261	69	593	78
<b>SA</b>	2	2	36	9	73	10
<b>Total</b>	<b>114</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>379</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>760</b>	<b>100</b>
<b>ANOVA</b>	<b>F-value: 35.189</b>			<b>P-value: 0.000</b>		

Table 3 shows the mean difference in content organization and easiness conducted by JICA, GTZ and PITE. The result shows that there is no significant difference in the content organization and easiness of training manuals of three organization ( $F=35.189$ ,  $p=0.000<.05$ ). In other words, all three organizations developed easy training content for the PSTs.

**Table 4: Mean difference in sufficient time of training**

Scale	JICA		GTZ		PITE	
SD	22	19	29	8	55	7
D	5	4	18	5	35	5
N	6	5	25	7	49	6
A	77	68	289	76	581	76
SA	4	4	18	5	40	5
<b>Total</b>	<b>114</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>379</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>760</b>	<b>100</b>
ANOVA	F-value: 112.893			P-value: 0.000		

Table 4 shows the mean difference in sufficient time for training conducted by JICA, GTZ and PITE. The result shows that there is no significant difference in sufficient time for training given by three organization ( $F=112.893$ ,  $p=.000<.05$ ). In other words, all three organizations were given adequate time for training for PSTs teachers.

**Table 5: Mean difference in knowledge, expertise and experience of trainers**

Scale	JICA		GTZ		PITE	
SD	13	11	32	8	41	5
D	17	15	22	6	22	3
N	4	4	16	4	37	5
A	71	62	293	77	621	82
SA	9	8	16	4	39	5
<b>Total</b>	<b>114</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>379</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>760</b>	<b>100</b>
ANOVA	F-value: 215.569			P-value: 0.000		

Table 5 shows the mean difference in knowledge, expertise and experience of master trainer nominated by JICA, GTZ and PITE. The result shows that there is no significant difference in knowledge, expertise and experience of master trainer nominated by JICA, GTZ and PITE ( $F=215.569$ ,  $p=.000<.05$ ). In other words, all three organizations nominated knowledgeable, expert and experience master trainer for PSTs' training.

**Table 6: Mean difference in basic facilities in training provided by all three organizations**

Scale	JICA		GTZ		PITE	
SD	13	11	32	8	41	5
D	17	15	22	6	22	3
N	4	4	16	4	37	5
A	71	62	293	77	621	82
SA	9	8	16	4	39	5
<b>Total</b>	<b>114</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>379</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>760</b>	<b>100</b>
ANOVA	F-value: 215.569			P-value: 0.000		

Table 6 shows the mean difference basic facilities in training provided by all three organizations. The result shows that there is no significant difference in Basic facilities in training provided by all three organizations ( $F=215.569$ ,  $p=.000<.05$ ). In other words, all three organizations provided basic facilities in training.

## Discussion

To compare the effectiveness of training of teachers performance conducted under JICA, GTZ and PITE is the key focus of this study. The result of the study indicated that teachers who received training for m all three different organizations (JIS, GTZ, and PITE) are very satisfied with training objectives, training content, participation level, trainers' expertise, and facilities (venue, training hall, handout, materials, and refreshment). The result of the study is in line with Shams (2015) and FATA Secretariat (2013) They found that JICA, GTZ, and PITE play key successful roles in teachers' training. All three organizations worked remarkably in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa in perspective of teachers' training. Based on the findings, teachers' performance is unpredictably increased after the training received from internal agencies like JICA and GTZ in collaboration with the Provincial Institute of Teacher Education.

## Conclusion and Recommendations

The main objective of the study was to compare the training of teachers performance conducted under JICA, GTZ, AND PITE in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The study concluded that teachers were highly satisfied and appreciated the training objectives, training content, participation level, trainers' expertise, and facilities (venue, training hall, handout materials, and refreshments). Moreover, the study concluded that all three organizations successfully achieved the training objectives. The study recommended that there's no follow-up mechanism for teachers performance who received training from JICA, GTZ, and PITE. Therefore, the government of KP developed a flow-up mechanism for such teachers to improve the professional skills of the teachers.

## Reference

- Abdullah, N. A., & Akhtar, S. (2019). Contributions of Major Foreign Aid Agencies to Education in Pakistan. *Paradigms*, 13(2), 33-40.
- Adams, C. (2003). Teacher Education and the Development of Professional Identities: Learning to Teach Primary Science. *Innovations in Education and Teaching International*, 40(2).
- Ahmad, S., & Khan, R. (2020). Exploring the Effectiveness of Science Training Program on the Performance of Science Teachers at Secondary School Level of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. *Dialogue (Pakistan)*, 15(2).
- Ali, T. (2011). Understanding how practices of teacher education in Pakistan compare with the popular theories and theories and narrative of reform of teacher education in international context. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 1(8), 208.
- Ali, A., Nasim, F., & Afridi, A. K. (2019). The Role Of International Donor Agencies In The Promotion Of Elementary Education In Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. *Dialogue (Pakistan)*, 14(3).
- Azam, F., Omar Fauzee, M. S., & Daud, Y. (2014). Teacher training education programme in three Muslim countries Afghanistan, Iran and Pakistan. *Journal of Education and Human Development*, 3(2), 729-741.
- Aziz, T., & Butt, M. N. (2022). Continuous Professional Development Of Primary School Teachers In Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. *Webology (ISSN: 1735-188X)*, 19(2).
- Harris, D. N., & Sass, T. R. (2011). Teacher training, teacher quality and student achievement. *Journal of public economics*, 95(7-8), 798-812.
- Hussain, S., Khan, A. N., & Shah, L. (2017). Perceptions of Teachers Regarding US-AID

Teacher Education Project on the Development of Elementary Education. *Journal of Elementary Education*, 27(2), 115-127.

- Javed, M., Juan, W. X., & Nazli, S. (2012). The Role of the Directorate of Staff Development (DSD) in Teacher Training in Pakistan in the Public Sector Schools. *Language in India*, 12(11).
- Khalil, U., Butt, I. Z., Haider, S., Naweed, N., & Khan, A. (2015). Quality of teaching & learning at directorate of staff development (DSD) in the Punjab province: Practices and problem. *Sci. Int.(Lahore)*, 27(5), 4763-4766.
- Krejcie, R. V., & Morgan, D. W. (1970). Determining sample size for research activities. *Educational and psychological measurement*, 30(3), 607-610.
- Kulshrestha, A. K., & Pandey, K. (2013). Teachers training and professional competencies. *Voice of research*, 1(4), 29-33.
- Lahore, P., Butt, M. H., & Shams, M. F. (2007). Final Report on Quality Assurance of Teacher Training Programs.
- Mustafa, G. (2012). Education policy analysis report of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. *Islamabad: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation*.
- Secretariat, F. A. T. A. (2013). Education sector analysis of the federally administered tribal areas (FATA) of Pakistan.
- Sekaran, U., & Bougie, R. (2016). *Research methods for business: A skill building approach*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Shah, S. A., & Khan, R. A. (2014). Impact of the education for all programme on the quality of primary education in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan: An empirical analysis. *Research in Applied Economics*, 6(2), 86-102.
- Tahira, M., Hassan, A., Malik, A., & Yousuf, M. I. (2020). Teacher Education in Pakistan: Issues and Problems. *Online Submission*.
- Shams, F. (2017). Aid Effectiveness in Education: A Case Study of Pakistan From 2005-2015.